Response ID ANON-2W2V-QH3U-J

Submitted to **A Culture Strategy for Scotland**
Submitted on **2018-09-19 15:28:46**

A vision for culture in Scotland

1 What is your view of the Vision as set out above?

Not Answered

2 If you have any further comments on the Vision, please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

If you have any further comments on the Vision, please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

Transforming through culture

3 What is your view of the ambition, 'Transforming through culture'?

Not Answered

4 If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Transforming through culture', please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Transforming through culture', please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

5 Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

Empowering through culture

6 What is your view of the ambition, 'Empowering through culture'?

Not Answered

7 If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Empowering through culture' please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Empowering through culture' please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

8 Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

Sustaining culture

9 What is your view of the ambition, 'Sustaining culture'?

Not Answered

10 If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Sustaining culture' please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

If you have further comments on the ambition, 'Sustaining culture' please provide them below. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

11 Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?

Please provide comments on the aims and actions under this ambition. What do you like, or dislike, or what would you change?:

Delivering A Culture Strategy for Scotland

12 Please provide details of any examples of good work and best practice, from Scotland or internationally, that you think could be included in the final strategy? We are interested in a range of different approaches.

Please provide details of any examples of good work and best practice, from Scotland or internationally, that you think could be included in the final strategy? We are interested in a range of different approaches. :

13   What can you or your organisation do to support the vision, aims, ambitions and actions of the strategy?

What can you or your organisation do to support the vision, aims, ambitions:

14   What do you think success for the strategy will look like?

What do you think success for the strategy will look like?:

Monitoring the Impact of the Strategy

15   What is your view of the proposed approach to monitoring and evaluating the strategy set out in section 5?

Not Answered

16   If you have further comments on the proposed monitoring and evaluation approach, please provide them below.

If you have further comments on the proposed monitoring and evaluation approach, please provide them below. :

Other comments

17   Please use this section to provide any other comments that you wish to share about the strategy.

Please use this section to provide any other comments that you wish to share about the strategy.:
Culture is a key area of concern for the Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights (CRER) due to its race equality implications.

We have found the consultation document itself difficult to comment on, as race equality is referred to infrequently and, even then, mostly in a vague and obfuscating way through use of general terms such as 'diversity' and 'inclusion'.

As such, I hope you will accept this as our organisational response. We would be happy to speak with you in more detail about any of the points raised below if that would be of use to you. Our response focusses on four key areas: 1) concerns with the draft strategy as written; 2) access to culture and the arts for Black and minority ethnic groups; 3) acknowledgement of the impact of institutional racism on culture and the arts; and 4) the need for better BME leadership in the culture and arts sector.

Concerns with the Draft Strategy

We note that as part of the 'Transforming Through Culture' strand that the Scottish Government intends to develop a new cultural leadership post, supported by strategic thinkers across the culture sector and beyond, and intends to develop a national partnership for culture which will include working with academic partners to develop new approaches to measure and increase understanding of culture. We believe that Black communities will be inevitably disadvantaged from this approach. Black groups are underrepresented within the culture sector, particularly in positions of leadership and academia. If an internal post is to be created, it should be accompanied by a panel of partners within the sector which includes Black voices; if this is not the case, the inequality will be perpetuated.

We support the aims within the 'Empowering Through Culture' strand, but again remind the Scottish Government that particular care is needed to ensure Black groups are involved in the movement to extend the view of culture and develop opportunities to participate in culture. We explore these issue further below.

We also welcome the aims within the 'Sustaining Culture' strand. For Black groups in particular, access to funding and opportunities is critical, as these groups face ongoing disadvantages and barriers. The model taken here should not be deficit-based – assuming Black groups lack capacity or skill – but should focus on changing spaces and places to increase the opportunities available to Black groups. This will require proactive approaches on the part of white-dominated cultural sectors to reduce barriers and genuinely embed equality of opportunity.

We also wish to comment on the use of the term 'diversity'. While it may be appropriate in some contexts, a focus on diversity can cloud or obscure the wider equality implications. Throughout the draft strategy, the term 'diversity' is used both in relation to ethnic diversity and in relation to overall diversity of cultural output or activity at various points throughout the strategy; this is unhelpful and risks conflating these concepts. We recommend that the term 'race equality' or 'representation of minority ethnic individuals and communities' be used instead of diversity in the context of race equality.

We strongly recommend that the final strategy be revised to include more detailed information on equality, particular to the protected characteristics, which examines implications and barriers for relevant groups individually. This should be drafted in consultation with people who have appropriate knowledge. Currently, the section on p.5 on 'Equality, Diversity and Inclusion' contains two basic errors – the protected characteristics are derived from equality law (human rights law is an entirely different legal framework), and the protected characteristic of sexual orientation has been missed out. Likewise, ethnicity and race are mentioned alongside each other as though diversity / representation on these grounds are somehow separate on p.37. The fact that these errors were not recognised and addressed during the editing process has worrying implications for the ability of the strategy to take proper cognisance of equality.

A place to examine these issues is the Equality Impact Assessment. The published partial assessment concluded that there would be no differential impact on protected characteristic groups and that everyone would benefit. We would question this approach, as there was not robust evidence published to determine if this was the case. The final EqIA should have sections specific to each protected characteristic group, examine available evidence, highlight evidence gaps, and recommend actions that should be taken to ensure all groups – especially those disadvantaged – are able to benefit from the strategy.

Access to Culture and the Arts for Black Groups

There is an issue regarding access to opportunities in the culture sector for Black groups. White artists and curators can more easily access opportunities and funding, as they have previously had opportunities to create and curate. Black artists are more likely to be overlooked for opportunities, which means they are also more likely to be overlooked or seen as unqualified for the next opportunity. This happens, we believe, because the main funding bodies are led by white people. If artists do not fit into a white, Eurocentric model of culture and art, they are not chosen for opportunities and projects, and are overlooked for funding. This Eurocentric model includes tokenistic approaches which value art and culture created by Black individuals and communities only where this reflects their ethnic heritage in some way, as part of an exoticised view of 'diversity' in culture sectors.

Creative Scotland's Survey on Diversity in the Arts found that half of minority ethnic respondents saw their ethnicity as a barrier to career progression, compared to just 5% of white respondents. Minority ethnic respondents also had a lower median income than the average - £15,000 compared to £20,000. Barriers listed included discrimination, a lack of interest and understanding of the cultural themes of their work, needing to work harder to get commissions as funders found the work harder to relate to, and lacking established networks and missing out on word-of-mouth recruitment as a result. Its Screen Equalities, Diversity, and Inclusion Survey also found that 40% of minority ethnic respondents believed that their ethnicity had been a barrier to progression. Minority ethnic respondents stated that often there was no one to 'give you a leg up', that their work was misunderstood and devalued, and that white groups resented the need for particular spaces for minority ethnic groups. Creative Scotland's 2015 Equality Impact Assessment of their regular funding stated that organisations with a significant focus on minority ethnic communities and artists were 'not yet ready' for regular funding.

Creative Scotland's Equality, Diversity, and Inclusion Report, published as part of its 2017 Public Sector Equality Duty reporting, detailed diversity in staff numbers and in regularly funded organisations. For 2015/16, 0% of Chief Executives, 0% of Artistic Directors, 0% of Chairs, 2% of Board members, 2% of permanent staff, 1.5% of freelance staff, and 1% of volunteers had a minority ethnic background. Creative Scotland itself had nearly 5% minority ethnic staff, but is based in the central belt of Scotland where the population figure is higher than the national average of 4% (12% in Glasgow and 8% in Edinburgh). Given this evidence, it is extremely disappointing that the draft strategy's only reference to the privilege experienced by white people in culture states that "Debate around whether a career within culture is largely accessible for those from a white, middle-class background only continues apace." The principle of evidence based policy would suggest that, for Scottish Government, this debate should be well and truly over.

While there is a growing interest in establishing groups for Black artists, there is a lack of support and funding to make this feasible and impactful. The strategy should consider calling for targets within these funding bodies to ensure Black groups are well represented in staff figures, and also in leadership roles. Consideration should also be given to ring-fencing portions of funding for Black groups to further equality of access. Again, this is not about building capacity – it is about overcoming institutional barriers to equality. Lack of equality of access to culture and a plan to address this should be present in the final strategy.

Acknowledgement of the Impact of Institutional Racism on Culture and the Arts

Culture cannot be divorced from its wider historical context and the implications of this. The history of slavery, colonialism, and empire continues to impact Black communities – and Black artists – in Scotland today. While the rich and complex history of Scotland is celebrated and studied and while Black communities have long been intertwined in this story, often this history ignores or poorly represents Black groups. It is essential that Black and white communities understand the broader story of Scotland's history to create social and cultural equality, and to promote a strong, pluralistic national identity for Scotland and its culture and arts sector.
To contribute to this, the final strategy – and wider policies – need to stop using soft language, e.g. 'diversity'. The conversation needs to be opened to include issues of white supremacy, white privilege, and white fragility.

Alongside this, there is a need to educate white leaders in the culture and arts sector (and beyond) about race equality and the long-standing reality of institutional racism and discrimination in Scotland, informed by the impact of slavery, colonialism, and empire. We need to move from a deficit-based model of building capacity for Black leadership, and instead expand the race equality knowledge of current leaders and decision makers. This will ensure that the need for pro-active approaches to create equality of opportunity is better understood.

This may open up culture and art spaces for Black communities in general. Black individuals tend to be under-represented in participation and attendance, as detailed in the Participation and Representation Evidence Paper for the Race Equality Framework for Scotland. A literature review conducted by the Scottish Government found that minority ethnic communities view mainstream art and culture as consisting of opera, ballet, Shakespearean theatre, classical music, and art galleries. Although minority ethnic groups recognise the role played by these, they were thought to be 'not for them'. Concern often surrounds the portrayal of history and there is a desire for more exhibits relating to their own their own heritage, reflecting a pluralistic, nuanced cultural landscape which is influenced by the complex histories and identities of its people. This should be acknowledged by and addressed in the final strategy.
In several places, the draft strategy alludes to the 'diversity of Scotland's population' which reflects the 'Scotland of today.' This acknowledges the impact of more recent migrants, but ignores the historical reality of long-established Black communities and the centuries-long impact of migration on Scotland. This language should be amended to reflect this, as the current approach makes it seem as though migration is new to Scotland.

Need for Better Black Leadership in the Arts and Culture Sector

In Scotland there is a common perception that Black leadership around culture should be limited to one of two extremes – firstly, celebrating heritages which are linked to a non-Scottish ethnicity, and secondly, encouragement to participate in very specifically 'Scottish' celebrations of heritage. Most critically, each of these extremes centres around ethnicity and heritage, limiting the potential for the type of cultural activity which is self-defined, innovative, and unconstrained by tradition.

This is problematic on two fronts. In the first instance, this contributes to an 'othering' of Black communities and creates a misleading impression of culture in which Black communities in Scotland are seen to be distanced from the culture of the majority white Scottish ethnic community. This same intention of 'distance' underlies the second instance detailed, in which Black communities are perceived to need encouragement to join in with traditional Scottish celebrations.

Although the draft strategy is clear that the concept of culture is an ever-evolving, dynamic, and plural reflection of the many ways in which society expresses itself, this is undermined by the constant conflation (within culture sectors and wider society) of ethnicity, heritage, and culture. Ethnicity and heritage are only one

small aspect of culture for any individual or group, yet this is the overwhelming focus when discussing race equality issues – to the point where the word 'culture' is used as a catch-all term to signify the connection between people of the same or similar ethnicities. This is reductive and patronising, and creates misunderstanding of what culture actually means.

The Scottish Government needs to take a more critical at who it engages with around funding for Black and minority ethnic arts and culture. There is also a need to examine the criteria used to determine which projects are funded, who distributes that funding, and what expertise is needed to create genuinely equal opportunities which are not predicated on outdated and simplistic notions of culture as a proxy for ethnicity or heritage. It should also be remembered that just because an individual is Black does not mean that they are expert in culture or race. These issues should be explored in the final strategy.

Thank you for your consideration of the issues we have raised here. We look forward to more engagement with you on these issues in the future.

Impact Assessments

18 Do you think the partial Equality Impact Assessment has identified where the strategy might impact on people differently depending on characteristics such as age, disability, gender, race, religion or belief, sexual orientation or gender identity?

Not Answered

19 If you have further comments on the Equality Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?

If you have further comments on the Equality Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?:

20 Do you think the partial Children's Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment sets out how the proposals presented in the strategy might impact on the rights and welfare of children?

Not Answered

21 If you have further comments on the Children's Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?

If you have further comments on the Children's Rights and Welfare Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?:

22 How do you think this strategy might impact upon people on low incomes, people living in deprived areas, people in material deprivation, people with no / or low wealth and people from different socio-economic backgrounds? Please provide comments below.

How do you think this strategy might impact upon people on low incomes, people living in deprived areas, people in material deprivation, people with no / or low wealth and people from different socio-economic backgrounds? Please provide comments below.:

23 Do you think the partial Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment identifies how the proposals presented in the Strategy might impact on businesses, the third (voluntary) sector or have any regulatory impact?

Not Answered

24 If you have further comments on the Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?

If you have further comments on the Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment, please provide them below. For example, what would you add or change?:

About you

What is your name?

Name:
Rebecca Marek

What is your email address?

Email:
rebecca@crer.org.uk

Are you responding as an individual or an organisation?

Organisation

What is your organisation?

Organisation:
Coalition for Racial Equality and Rights

The Scottish Government would like your permission to publish your consultation response. Please indicate your publishing preference:

Publish response with name

We will share your response internally with other Scottish Government policy teams who may be addressing the issues you discuss. They may wish to contact you again in the future, but we require your permission to do so. Are you content for Scottish Government to contact you again in relation to this consultation exercise?

Yes